Minutes of the Regular Agenda Meeting of the Mayor and Council of the City of South Tucson, Arizona, held Tuesday, October 3, 2023, at 6:00 p.m., at the City of South Tucson Council Chambers, 1601 S. 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, South Tucson, Arizona.

Staff Present:	Veronica Moreno, Interim City Manager Lourdes Aguirre, Finance Director Danny Denogean, Public Safety Director and Chief of Police Josue Licea, Planning Director Jon Paladini, City Attorney
Councilors Present:	Mayor Paul Diaz Vice Mayor Herman Lopez Acting Mayor Rita Rogers Councilor Anita Romero (Excused) Councilor Cesar Aguirre Councilor Brian Flagg Councilor Roxanna Valenzuela
Others Present:	Mariemma and Yareli Lopez, Not residents Allen Benz, Resident Andy Luna, Fire Department Mel Dominguez, Resident

Mayor Diaz called the Regular Agenda Meeting of October 3, 2023, to order at 6:02 p.m. Please stand for the Pledge of Allegiance and Land Acknowledgment and Mission Statements.

ITEM #03 - LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND MISSION STATEMENT

Vice Mayor Lopez: On behalf of South Tucson residents, we honor the Tribal Nations who have served as caretakers of this land from time immemorial and respectfully acknowledge the ancestral homelands of the Tohono O'odham Nation and the multi-millennial presence of the Pascua Yaqui Tribe within South Tucson. Consistent with the City of South Tucson's commitment to diversity and inclusion, we strive toward building equal-partner relationships with Arizona's Tribal Nations.

Acting Mayor Rogers: The Mission Statement of the City of South Tucson is to build up this community through mutual cooperation between we, your public servants, and you our citizens so that jointly we can build a safer and stronger City. Amen.

Mayor Diaz: Please remain standing. Vice Mayor Lopez.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Yes, I'm going to have a moment of silence for one of our residents that passed away yesterday, that was one of our neighbors. She was married to Alex Higuera, which is a long time South Tucsonan. We are sorry for the whole family; she has been sick for a while. May she rest in peace.

Mayor Diaz: Sylvia Salomon.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Thank you.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 2 of 32

Vice Mayor Lopez: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you.

ITEM #04 – <u>ROLL CALL (By City Manager Moreno)</u>:

Vice Mayor Lopez. Here. Acting Mayor Rogers. Here. Councilor Anita Romero asked to be excused, Mayor. Mayor Diaz. Here. Councilor Flagg. Yes. Councilor Aguirre. Yes. Councilor Valenzuela. Here.

#### **ITEM #05 – APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mayor Diaz: Do we have a motion to approve the Minutes of the Regular Meeting for September 19<sup>th</sup>.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Mr. Mayor, may I talk about them for second?

Mayor Diaz: Go ahead and make a motion first.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Motion first then I'll talk about it. I'll move to approve the Minutes but that's not what I I'd like to do.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Second.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you. Discussion.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Discussion is I think the Minutes are very, very, very lightweight. They are only a total of five pages. I think a lot more happened in that meeting, so I don't know what's going on, five pages.

Councilor Flagg: Yeah, I was wondering the same thing.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Everybody I had talked with in here had a microphone.

Ms. Moreno: If I may, Mayor and Acting Mayor Rogers. We had technical difficulties. I didn't realize that the recorder turned off during the meeting. I was able to capture part of the conversation which typically we do verbatim, but I did get all the motions which is generally the most important, and in final form and who approved, and the final outcome of each action item. That is the reason why we didn't have them verbatim which is not a requirement by law; the requirement is that we have who made the motion and who made the second. So my apologies for the technical difficulties. Our recorder is on right now, so the Minutes are there, the motions are there with all the information that the Council made as far as the action items so that is why the Minutes are shorter than typical.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: The Minutes are as such. Do I hear a motion?

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 3 of 32

Councilor Flagg: Yeah, so moved. Accept the Minutes.

Mayor Diaz: It's already been moved and seconded.

Councilor Flagg: Ok.

Mayor Diaz: Roll Call.

Vice Mayor Lopez. Yes. Acting Mayor Rogers. Aye, as is. Mayor Diaz. Yes. Councilor Flagg. Yes. Councilor Aguirre. Aye. Councilor Valenzuela. Yes.

### CALL TO PUBLIC

Mayor Diaz: Is there anybody in the public that would like to address the Mayor and Council?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, Mr. Mayor. I have a total of three cards that have been submitted. The first one is from Mariemma and Yareli Lopez. They don't indicate whether resident or not, but the address is 204 W. Calle Media Luz. The topic is Temporary Care Program. You may approach.

Mrs. Lopez: Hi there, this is our first time doing this, so we are with Foster Homes Pet Rescue. We wanted to present our Temporary Care Program. We are currently in need of fosters and if somebody is in crisis, we are also able to assist with them. That is what our program is for. So our Temporary Care Program is in Tempe and we are expanding here in Tucson. The Temporary Care Program assists people who are in crisis, like, for example, eviction, homeless, domestic violence, medical, foreclosure, anything. Anything that people are going through we can help them with. One of the reasons is because sometimes when people are going through these types of crisis, they don't want to go to a shelter, or they don't want to get any help because they are thinking about their pets. So we can help them go through this crisis, taking care of their pets. We will pay for medical and boarding and also, that is why we need foster homes so they can help us out to be successful in this program. So I am here in Tucson. I live in Sahuarita, so we are here to help, and I have flyers here.

### Mayor Diaz: Do you have flyers?

Mrs. Lopez: Yes. Here's one for each of you guys. This is for the Temporary Care Program. Also, we do have a partnership with Arizona Pet Project. There are two different flyers, one is the Temporary Care Program and the other is for the foster program. I do have flyers for the Arizona Pet Project. They are not here but they asked if we were willing to distribute some flyers because they do help out also. I have them in Spanish and in English. So, with temporary boarding if someone is sick, they do also have someone here in Tucson who is locally and they do help out with food. That's it, three minutes? Ok. Thank you so much.

### Mayor Diaz: Thank you.

Ms. Aguirre: The next speaker we have is Allen Benz. Address is not specified but he put down the Housing Authority. The topic is HUD - Fed Shutdown - Transit Update.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 4 of 32

Mr. Benz: Good evening, Mayor, members of the Council. My name is Allen Benz. I am a South Tucson resident since 2011. I live in South Tucson Housing Authority and the first topic is the still impending federal government shutdown because of the continuing budget situation. Last week I went and retrieved a copy of the official contingency plans for HUD in case of a federal shutdown, and I copied that and I sent an email to the City Manager with that information, along with a list of frequently asked questions. One takeaway from that is that if the new deadline is like the middle of November, and if indeed it should come to an actual federal shutdown, the official contingency plans for HUD is that only about 350 HUD employees nationwide out of about 8,500 will be available for work and on an emergency basis only. Everything else is contained in the document the Manager has. So with that, I will leave that and go to the last week's transit meeting. There would be a stakeholder's meeting arranged, authorized by Mayor and Council and arranged by the Tucson Transportation Department. The focus seemed to be on different types of organizational structure that could be done for realignment of organizational entities for Sun Tran and also on funding for the system, and the focus there is on the city hotel/motel room tax currently. My time is just about up so I will take my way. Thank you.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Thank you.

Councilor Valenzuela: Thank you.

Councilor Flagg: Thank you.

Ms. Aguirre: The final speaker is Mr. Andy Luna. The address listed is 1601 S. 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Mr. Luna is the Fire Department's Captain, and the topic is Fire Department.

Mr. Luna: Mr. Mayor, members of the Council. My name is Andy Luna as you guys are well aware by now. I work for the City of South Tucson's Fire Department as Captain. So, just once again I'm bringing up, I haven't heard anything again, about the Fire Department. I know it's kind of here and there hit and miss, but as the Fire Department, we would like to know what is going on with talks, if any, and what's going to happen either way. We are kind of in the dark right now. We are still operating with three firefighters which is potentially a liability if something were to happen, so we are continuing to ask for four, four guys on the truck at all times which is the recommendation, that's what they say as far as OSHA recommendation is, and we have the employees to do that right now so we don't have to hire anybody new, so we could do that. So, again, hopefully we can find out anything that is going on, that would be greatly appreciated. The fire guys, they are asking me all the time what's happening. I'm trying to get some information for them. Again, as always, please contact me anytime you like. Thank you for your time.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you.

Ms. Aguirre: We have one more speaker. The name is Mel, resident, address is 1802 S. 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The topic is #23 bus versus Sun Tran; Fire Department.

Mr. Dominguez: Hello, everyone. It's nice to see you all. I did come in late so I apologize for the lateness, but on the #23 bus, there is some reporting back from the community. You know, there's elderly folks in the community that would love to hop onto the #23 bus because they still want to practice their independence. They've lost a loved one, their husband of a long time, and they are trying to be independent, but they also don't want to bother people. The #23 has been a bus that is just down the street from her home, and she Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 5 of 32

feels uncomfortable to ride it. She's an elder so she has called Sun Tran. Sun Tran says, we won't pick you up because you've got a bus right down the street. So that's one. And then two, with the Fire, with Andy Luna last night, right across the way over at Handyman Haven, there was two people that I encountered. The first one was looking like they were hiding from something, and then the other was sitting closest to the business and he was lighting a fire. And even though the Fire Department is right across the street, they are out on these other calls that are not fire related, and that's what I have to say.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you for the information.

Ms. Aguirre: That concludes the Call to the Audience.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you. The next item is Item #06.

## ITEM #06 - MAYOR AND COUNCIL MEMBERS: REPORTS OF CURRENT EVENTS

Vice Mayor Lopez: Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Diaz: Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Lopez: I have some information. Two Sundays ago, I participated in painting the mural that's for the Garden Kitchen and that was something exciting on Sunday afternoon to go out there and meet a lot of people just painting the mural that was consigned by us, and I just wish most of the Council people would have been there to show some kind of support, but it was good. Then, tomorrow night I am attending a CAP annual dinner that they have up at Ventana Canyon. Then on Friday I have one with the Sunnyside Foundation on El Pueblo Senior Center, and it's an event on the southside from 5-7:00. It's open to the public. That's all I have at this time, Mr. Mayor.

Mayor Diaz: Acting Mayor.

Acting Mayor Rogers: I just would like to thank the great Ms. Imelda and all the people that work with her, plus Betty who was there. It was just the greatest, what did we name it, I forget the name?

Ms. Villegas: The Health and Wellness Fair?

Acting Mayor Rogers: Yes, at Housing. It was very, very well done and super good, and I was there, and I want it in the Minutes. They also said Betty came up and she started talking and she gave a Well Fair thing to all the people that she's known for all that time, so she also spoke. She is now our gal from up in Phoenix, not Housing, but she'll help us and I want that in the Minutes. Thank you, I really liked it a lot, very helpful to the people. Thank you, Imelda and Betty and others.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you. Anybody have anything else? No? Moving on to Item #07.

### ITEM #07 - CITY MANAGER AND DEPARTMENT HEADS: REPORTS TO MAYOR AND COUNCIL

Ms. Moreno: Yes, Mr. Mayor, we have a report from the Planning Department.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 6 of 32

Mr. Licea: Good evening, Mayor and Council, is everybody doing good today? Just a quick recap of last week's activities. We did complete an application for the Planning and Zoning Commission that was posted on the website, I believe last Tuesday. Through today, we have only received one letter of interest, not a complete application, but one letter of interest from one gentleman living off of 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue, so we followed up today and sent them an application. We are waiting for some more activity on that, and if you guys know some potential Commission members who are interested in applying for that position.

Councilor Flagg: Is there a deadline for applying?

Mr. Licea: Yes, there was a week. That is what was said last week, or at the last Council meeting, to open it for one week, so today would technically be one week, but we've only got one application. So it's open I guess until it's filled. I mean, we could wait until the next Council meeting. I could recommend we wait until then and see how many we get until then, and if we have more than three, then you guys make a selection.

Mayor Diaz: Yeah, that's the direction. Thank you.

Mr. Licea: Then I just want to kind of touch base on the 36<sup>th</sup> Street bike lane pop-up event that we held in partnership with the City of Tucson. This was held last Saturday, September 30<sup>th</sup> from 9-11:00 a.m. at the Pico parking lot. It was a very good event. We had about 20 people show up, so overall, all the comments were very supportive of the project. We can bring some other information in future once we get all the materials compiled, but overall, the community was very receptive and supportive of this project. And just in the future, I want to make a mention that I want to bring an idea to our community on the El Paso Southwestern Greenway, just initial thoughts right now, kind of brainstorming about things we could do, how would I say, make this a family-oriented linear park. One of the ideas Greg Hitt brought to the team after he visited Atlanta is that Atlanta has a similar bike lane in Atlanta, and what they do there is they identified an area, and I don't know the footage of the length, but you got a bike lane, then they created an overlay that goes somewhere like 50 feet extended from each side of the bike lane. In this overlay what it allows for is a little bit looser zoning regulations to allow your mom or your pop s to set up a shop somewhere near the bike lane. So, it's just an idea, just food for thought to see if you guys like that idea and have any comments, it's whatever and we will work that in, but it's just an idea that we would like to bring to the Council members in the future to look into making this a path that is widely used and have your mom and pop stores set up shop right next door. And that's all I have.

### Mayor Diaz: Ok, thank you. Any more reports?

Ms. Moreno: So I just want to say out loud for those in the audience and anyone listening to our audio, but as the Planning Director mentioned, we have three vacancies on the Planning and Zoning Commission. There's a questionnaire for anybody that is interested. The criteria is that it be a business person or a resident of the City. So again, there's three vacancies until we can get at least three applications and Staff will present them to Mayor and Council. If you are interested, get a questionnaire, talk to any of your neighbors or any businessperson you think is interested, and have them submit to Planning and Zoning and they can forward your recommendation to Mayor and Council.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 7 of 32

Mayor Diaz: Thank you. Any further reports? No? Thank you. If I may, I would like to change the order of these items. Item #09 would become #08, and Item #08 would become #09. If I have a consensus with that, we will go ahead with Item #08.

### ITEM #08 - PIMA COUNTY HEALTH DEPARTMENT - MENTAL HEALTH ADVOCACY, RECOGNITION

Ms. Altamirano: Good afternoon, Mayor, Acting Mayor, actually evening. I would like so start off by thanking you for this opportunity to talk to you about a special program that is near and dear to my heart. I work for the Pima County Health Department and my name is Andrea Altamirano and I work for a program called Community Mental Health and Addiction. I would like to give you each a flyer. The programs that we offer to all community members and also to any agencies, really, who would want to take our programs. It is free, we are grant funded. The top page that you have here is a description of the programs that we offer. The one I would like to talk about is the program that I lead, it's called Mental Health First Aid. By a show of hands, have any of you heard about Mental Health First Aid or know what it is? No? Ok, very good. Quick question: how many of you have taken first aid, like CPR? Ok, very good. So what I would like to say is that mental health first aid is like CPR, but for the mind. This wonderful program got started, so you will see my mascot, Mr. LG, he's a koala, not a koala bear but a koala. This program is an evidence-based training, and it originated in Australia in 2001 and it was created by a nurse who specializes in education. Her name is Betty Kitchener and Anthony Jorn who is a mental health Literacy Professor. So it got brought into the United States in 2001 as an adult mental health first aid training, and since then, they have created several modules. The modules that we teach in our program are the adult, youth, and I just got trained in Spanish mental health first aid which I am very excited about. Eventually, I'll also do the Tribal modules. All of these are for adults, but the youth mental health first aid is designed for adults who interact with youth, which could be parents or youth-serving agencies. They are each eight hours long and they involve a little bit of pre-work that you do, similar to like when you take a CPR course and it's registered through the National, our classes are also registered through the National Council for Mental Wellbeing which is the umbrella which oversees the Program, along with the Department of Health, I think in Missouri, but don't quote me on that one. However, it is a nationally known program and I just kind of wanted to give you a quick overview of what it is so you are welcome to share with your constituency, with family members, with anyone that would listen to you about mental health first aid. It is such a critical topic and important topic for everyone, really. So, what I wanted to mention is the different type of classes that we offer in our program are really related to the most critical issues that are related to mental health, such as suicide prevention, drug overdose, and specifically, the mental health first aid program that I teach incorporates all that into one training. What participants receive when they complete the training is not only the tools that I will talk about in a minute, but they are certified as mental health first aiders. The certificate is good for three years once they complete the training. So, they also get something back; it's great to just have the knowledge and the tools to be able to help someone, but it is also nice to have it on your resume, to get the certificate. So I just wanted to ask a question, so if we saw a person having a heart attack, more than likely we would know what to do, right, either are you going to perform CPR or you would call 9-1-1 to get the help that they need. But few of us know what to do when we see a person who is suffering from a mental health challenge or who might be having suicidal thoughts, or they would say someone who is actually having a panic attack. Would you know what to do, how to approach them, what to say. Most of us, a lot of us don't really have an idea, and it's related to a lot of different stigmas, culture, not being able to reach out, and

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 8 of 32

just a variety of different things as to why we don't actually reach out and help someone. So with this training, it teaches us really, it equips us with the tools and resources to be able to identify, how to understand, and how to help the person who might be experiencing a mental health challenge or might be in an actual crisis. Now, we talk about what challenges are, what mental illness is, what mental disorders are. We go into great detail about seven different disorders that we cover, just to give participants a baseline and an understanding of what mental health issues are. During the class we work on a lot of different exercises together as a group to help us understand how to really identify those possible disorders, and really, the important thing is how to help, how to be able to have that first conversation and ask them, hey, I noticed that you haven't been the same lately, you seem to be down. How can we help you? Is something going on? Many times, it's just asking a simple question like that that can help a person just open up and be able to tell you, yes, I feel like I am depressed. We teach you the tools as to what to do when someone expresses something like that. And it might be just to be there for that person, just to have that conversation and talk with them, or it might be to be able to find those resources and information to refer them to where do you go? To somewhere in Tucson, we have those community resources that are available, behavioral health agencies, counselors, it might be a professional PCP, it might be just other types of self-help therapies that might be helpful to the person. So, really what mental health first aid is, we really work on identifying things early on so you can help the person in their trajectory, right, in their life to be successful, but we also talk about the people who may not have received the help and they really don't know where to go or what to do, so not only does it equip us with resources to be able to understand the resources that we refer the information so we know where to reach out for help here in Tucson and just to kind of have that empathy and understanding to be able to talk to people. So these are the main things that they added to mental health first aid is the conversation of culture and how that has an impact on our mental health, the conversations about substance use and overdose, the fentanyl epidemic that we have going on here in Tucson, and then also self-care because it is very important to be able to take care of yourself before you can help others. So, this is the class that we offer and throughout the last couple of years, I noticed a trend. I noticed that a lot of agencies were reaching out to us to take the training and these agencies were saying, I want my employees to get trained in mental health first aid, because one, they serve the public, and also need it for themselves because many times when you use mental health first aid, you end up using it on family members. You end up identifying things and helping co-workers, colleagues, friends, family, and also the constituents that you might be working with. So this is where our Certification of Recognition comes in. Betty Villegas requested training for her employees, and we started the training and along with our Health Department Director, Dr. Theresa Cullen, we have so many different agencies. We have people from Raytheon who have gotten trained and have requested our training; we have recurring employees who keep coming from Old Pueblo Community Services, because they are requiring employees to take mental health first aid. We also have agencies that are just encouraging their employees to take the training. We have Easter Seals Foundation who is taking the training. We have the City Courts Staff and also the County Justice Court Staff who it is really important for, especially for individuals who work with our community to be trained in these trainings. So, I was just really proud that so many agencies, I know at least ten of them that have been sending their employees to us and then themselves that have taken trainings. We have Judges taking the training, so I'm just really proud of that. We decided to honor our businesses and agencies who are working with communities with a Certificate of Recognition, and I'll go ahead and read it and I would like to invite Staff to come up. So the Certificate of Recognition is proudly presented on September 2023 to the South Tucson

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 9 of 32

Housing Authority for their commitment to creating a culture of support and compassion by prioritizing mental health for their employees and our community. So I just wanted to take the time to say thank you, and let you know that these programs are available through Pima County and also recognize these individuals who got trained not too long ago.

Acting Mayor Rogers: They're so great, unbelievable.

(Applause).

Acting Mayor Rogers: Come on, Betty, what do you say, say something.

Ms. Villegas: Thank you, Andrea, for the recognition. It's important, I felt at the time when I found out about the classes, I thought it was important for our Staff, including our maintenance staff who aren't able to make it, took this training because we pretty much, for ourselves, but also for our residents and our community. I think it was very worthwhile and I encourage anyone, anyone, to take this first aid course for sure.

Ms. Altamirano: And also if you are interested, we do have a backlog right now of trainings, and I am booked through December, but we are starting more community trainings in February and March. Our general mental health first aid at Pima.gov email address is there, but you can email me or contact me directly and I would be happy to host a training for you or whoever you would like to send my way.

Ms. Villegas: I thought it would be nice for Staff to stand in front of you all for a picture. Thank you.

Council Members: Thank you (applause).

Ms. Moreno: Give us a couple minutes to set up the presentation here.

ITEM #09 - POVERTY INITIATIVE - PRESENTATION BY PIMA COUNTY

Ms. Villegas: It's me again and this is still not my new official hat. This is the prosperity initiative that started back in, well, it started in April 2022 when Bonnie Bazata went and gave a talk to Councilor Lane Santa Cruz and her staff about ending poverty. From that, Councilor Santa Cruz wanted to form a joint task force with the County to start looking at policies on poverty and how we can address poverty. So from there, Bonnie then took it to the Pima County Board of Supervisors and they requested a detailed plan and discussions resulted in focus on evidence-based policy, it was really important that it was evidence-based policy, that would reduce poverty with regional and multijurisdictional participation. Then in November 2022 the plan was submitted to the Board and approved by the Board of Supervisors and a regional working group was formed. That's when I was selected actually by the City Manager when I was here in South Tucson to represent South Tucson on this prosperity initiative working group. We started meeting in December 2022, on the next slide you should have a copy of all the partners that are represented in this working group and a lot of work has gone into it, along with the University of Arizona. So the mandate was to develop a set of policies that guide long-term efforts that create community wealth by addressing generational poverty and improving opportunity, while also addressing the immediate needs of those currently experiencing poverty, for adoption by local government. So the goal is to really present all the governmental jurisdictions with some policies that then you all could potentially have and approve and authorize to start using those policies or something close to that. So my job

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 10 of 32

was really just to introduce you to, and give you a little history on the project, and then I was going to introduce our team leaders, our work group leaders which are Bonnie Bazata, which I don't know how many of you have met Bonnie, but Bonnie, I met her when Art Eckstrom brought her back from Indiana, as she used to work for Art years ago, then she left, and he brought her back when I was at the County Housing and her and I immediately connected. She would do workshops on ending poverty, Bridges Out of Poverty initiative that she worked on, and then she kind of tweaked that to our community and has done just amazing work in community in trying to find solutions to poverty and helping people with economic upward mobility. So that's Bonnie, Bonnie Bazata. Then we have Allison Miller from the City of Tucson here. And then we have Nicole Fife from the Pima County Administrator's Office, and we have Keith Bentley from the U of A Research. He's a Sociology Associate Professor. I love hearing him speak. Every time I've heard this presentation, I've learned something new, so thank you, Keith. I think that is it. So with that, I am going to turn it over to Bonnie and we will get started with the presentation.

Ms. Bazata: Mayor Diaz and Council Members, thank you so much for giving us this time and giving us this opportunity to talk to you about the prosperity initiative, and Betty, thank you so much for that wonderful introduction. So researchers like Keith will tell us that there are four ways that we can address poverty. We can prevent it. We can alleviate suffering. We can aid the transition, and we can address structures like those big affordable housing or wages or those kinds of structural issues. And so oftentimes with all the right intentions, we put a lot of effort into alleviating suffering because we don't want people to be homeless. We don't want people to be hungry, we don't want moms not to have diapers, you know, all those really important things. This initiative is asking, can we try to get upstream from that. Can we work with elected bodies like yourself to look at policies that might help more families stabilize economically and really think of that next generation. I call it cathedral building, right. Oftentimes the people who started cathedrals knew that they would be dead before the cathedral was done, but they made that investment in their community and in their faith. So that's really what the prosperity initiative is asking, can we start looking upstream so we can help more families and build prosperity in our community. And as mentioned, we have two researchers who have been working with us, we have Keith, who is going to talk to you about a couple policies today, and Brian Mayer, who some of you may recognize. He worked with the Rothchild (inaudible) on poverty issues. And the challenges as we are looking at policies, we have to figure out, we have a toolbox, right. Our toolbox is not the federal government's toolbox, it's not the State toolbox. It's the City, County, Tribal toolbox, so what can we do within that frame that's going to make the most sense. So this first phase that we have been in, sort of this policy development, you know, I'm really a practitioner, not a policy person. I have read a lot of policy but now being tasked with figuring out what fits into our toolbox and with our community has been a really interesting process. We hope to bring to the Board of Supervisors a set of policies. We originally set five to ten, now we have twelve, and we have three what we call cross policy strategies and if we had all night we could walk you through all of them, but given our time frame, we chose three to look at today. And then in the second phase what we will be doing is really analyzing first of all where are we placing our resources, right. Are we putting them in the right direction, are we missing opportunities, what other funding opportunities should we be looking at, how do we work with our partners in the community to really pull together to make a difference. So we have had a lot of stakeholder meetings, we will continue to have a lot of stakeholder meetings. We know it is so important to talk to our practitioners and experts as well as people with lived experience in our

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 11 of 32

community and keep getting that feedback. As we have been looking at the policy and as Betty mentioned, many of you may know Dr. Garcia, who is our Deputy Administrator. He knows his research and he tasked us with finding research that shows causal effects. We can come to you thinking these policies have the greatest chance of making a difference, but it's a high bar. Recently, a report was just released from a national organization that was looking at reducing intergenerational poverty along the same lines so it will be no surprise to know what they said is first of all, investing in children is the best way for us to really make a difference. But there are policies that we need to look at around health and income, reducing expenses, and building assets and opportunities. So really, that's that next stage for families, is how do we help families start working on assets, building from college education to homeownership, to savings and that kind of thing. And we know too, that children suffer poverty at a higher rate than any other segment of our population, which is not good because the sooner you are in poverty, the longer you are in poverty and the harder it is to get out. Then you get in that intergenerational cycle that makes it even harder to get out, so this is really saying that we need to, it's time to pay attention and make that focus. We know that poverty spreads geographically differently across our County. Of course, here in South Tucson the poverty level for Pima County is about 16% and it's about three times that, as you know, in South Tucson. This community is one that we need to be especially focused on. And then we know race and ethnicity, that is also unfairly distributed with people of color, particularly Native Americans, African Americans and Latinos being the hardest hit by poverty. Two other slides that you have in there, just to mention, opportunity is another way researchers are looking at this. It's a slightly different variation but an important one, and one way, and I'll be honest, Tucson and Pima County does not rank well using that criteria. There's something called a Child Opportunity Index which Keith is going to explain more about in the neighborhood reinvestment policy, about 29 indicators, and when we compare Tucson to 100 other metros, we are in the bottom ten and also in the bottom ten when it comes to more children being concentrated in low opportunity, high poverty areas. So again, it's just another way to kind of looking at the problem and saying we have a lot of work to do. So in looking at policies, we kind of grouped them into these four areas: education, critical family resources, and assets and infrastructure building, as well as these three cross-policy strategies. And so with that, I am going to turn it over to my colleague, Keith Bentley. We selected three that we thought would be the best fit for you tonight. One is on our housing stability policy, the second is our neighborhood reinvestment policy, and the third one is our work force development policy. So I will be back for workforce, but Keith is going to take the next two. Thank you.

Mr. Bentley: Good evening, Mayor and Council. Thanks so much for giving me a few minutes. I moved here in 2001 to go to grad school at the University of Arizona, Sociology Department. I fell in love with Tucson. I have been studying poverty and inequality in the American safety net since, and this is great for me to be here talking to you about this topic. So, usually I use the PowerPoint to guide my remarks, so as Bonnie mentioned, we have a bunch of different policies areas. I am going to talk to you first about our housing stability area. So we argue that, we recommend that jurisdictions should try to increase housing stability by preventing victims of foreclosures, mitigating the negative consequences when forced moves actually do occur. increasing homeownership especially for those in high poverty areas and to increase the stock of affordable housing generally. I just want to underline, highlight and asterisk the last one, increasing the stock of affordable housing is the most cost-effective way to reduce poverty because it reduces the main expense for low-income households. If you have to spend less on your rent or your mortgage, you have more resources to meet the

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 12 of 32

challenges to deal with unexpected expenses and on the positive side to provide opportunities and investments for yourself and your children. So the way we frame this is that evictions and foreclosures and housing stability in general has enormous qualms for adults, for kids, for families, for communities at large, so we argue that you can increase the opportunity for children by reducing the harms of the housing instability through these different protections that we will talk about in a moment. The benefits of these policies would be highly concentrated in these low-income areas that have a lot of churn in the housing stock with people moving in and out and between different usually lower end rental arrangements. Furthermore, if we are able to help people protect assets and resources that they have built up, especially in the case of homeownership, preventing the loss of a home, really prevents like an intergenerational asset that can be very beneficial for households. So slide #19, we have a long list of some of the harms that could be reduced. I won't go through all of these but basically if you think about our homeless services system, like the pressure on that system which is currently completely overburdened, about one out of nine folks who seek services from our system actually get prioritized for health services. So reducing the overall pressure of the system can be very helpful and as I mentioned before, the public health literature has documented dozens and dozens of negative impacts in terms of physical health, mental health, child mistreatment, domestic violence, hospitalizations, and it goes on and on. All of those things increase when people are experiencing the intense stress of housing insecurity. So that could potentially all be reduced and the material loss that can come as a result from losing your belongings or losing your home in the worst case, and that could also potentially be prevented. So we argue that these protective policies can support basically the health and well being of households that otherwise would be vulnerable. For children, it supports their physical and mental health and their ability to engage in education, and it also actually increases the efficacy of our other safety net programs, so people again are spending less on their housing. The other benefits, food stamps and AHCCCS and things like this can kind of provide more of a support for those households. As Bonnie mentioned, the folks that are most impacted by housing insecurity are historically marginalized groups, folks living in areas of concentrated poverty and the one group that has the highest rate of housing insecurity is single women with children, women of color in particular, the majority of whom find themselves housing-cost burdened and again, very vulnerable to these risks of displacement and at worst, homelessness. So as all of us probably are aware, rent has gone up enormously, the estimates are something like 37-42% in the last three years. Obviously, incomes have not kept pace with that, so that has created a situation where a lot of low-income households have a much harder financial balance sheet to figure out with these increased housing costs. So we recommend a couple different types of programs that can reduce housing insecurity, so rental assistance programs. These are all examples that have been demonstrated in careful literature to reduce some of these negative impacts. Rental assistance, housing vouchers, and legal representation for people experiencing housing insecurity. And the last one, if you can avoid an eviction filing on your record, this is some type of black mark that just follows people around, and then in the context of a tight rental market, it can be a really be a bar that prevents people from returning to housing. In the context of Tucson and Pima County we offer some implementation ideas in our policy briefs, so currently we have the EELS program, the Emergency Eviction Legal Services program. We recommend expanding and funding that. We argue that Pima County should develop an emergency rental assistance program. We also argue that there should be coordination with the Justice Courts to reduce the impact of evictions, ideally, to find non-judicial resolution strategies that don't result in an eviction on someone's record. In order to increase the stock of affordable housing, we argue that there should be more

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 13 of 32

support for shared equity models, so these are things like community land trusts, (inaudible), shared appreciation loans, deed-restricted housing programs, and basically all these are different ways to reduce the cost of buying a unit, whether that be a unit, an apartment, a house on land but the land is owned by the land trust, but the basic idea is that that equity, the cost of that, is reduced dramatically so someone can kind of buy into a more reasonable, manageable, accessible equity-building option, and when they turn around and sell, there are some resale restrictions which basically means it has to be sold to someone at a similarly affordable accessible rate. So as people ideally cycle through it allows them to build a little equity as a stepping stone to perhaps another maybe larger traditional home mortgage product, and that leaves that behind them for the next person to come through. So there are lots of different models for this, but these are just in general, and have been shown in literature to be very effective in helping people again kind of get that stepping stone out of poverty. Homeownership is a very powerful protection against dramatic changes in rent prices, for example, would not affect you, you benefit from home price increases as your equity increases, and there's basically abundant literature that shows that people, children that are living in homes where their parents own the home have better long-term outcomes, are more likely to go to college, they are  $1 \frac{1}{2}$  times more likely to own a home themselves. They are less likely to receive public assistance, and in general we find much more housing stability for first-time homeowners. We have a couple implementation strategies on slide #24. I'll just skip over that in light of time, I'll take a pause for a second, so that is a very, very quick overview of our housing stability prong in the prosperity initiative. So we also were asked to develop a neighborhood reinvestment strategy, so that is the next area we will go to, slide #25. So the language of our policy recommendation here is that we should revitalize more opportunity neighborhoods by improving the quality of life and opportunity in these areas by investing both physical and social infrastructure in manners that intentionally strive to prevent the displacement of vulnerable residents, center the priorities of those local residents, and build community wealth in those low opportunity areas. So essentially the literature is very clear about the guality of neighborhoods impacts children and impacts them over their life course. I won't get into (inaudible) but there's been a lot of debate for a long time in literature as to whether it was the characteristics of families or their communities, but I would say the kind of results are in now and it is very clear that places have affects, which I would say was sort of everybody's common sense understanding of the situation, but the recent literature suggests that if you want to improve the opportunities of children in the future, you should invest in the conditions they are living in as children. So basically, the place space strategies that try to revitalize neighborhoods can be very effective for increasing opportunity and in context of the prosperity initiative that is reducing intergenerational poverty, hopefully. So we basically argue in brief that the vast majority of efforts to invest in low-income neighborhoods historically have had negative impacts for the most vulnerable residents. They have largely displaced the lowest income residents and the main beneficiaries have generally been the developers, the realtors and corporations that are not necessarily from the neighborhood.

### Councilor Flagg: Thank you.

Mr. Bentley: So we recommend an aggressive, proactive strategy to push against those kind of common, unfortunately very common dynamics that unfold. On slide #28 we have a definition of equitable development so it's a positive development approach that employs policies and programs to meet the needs of all community members with a particular focus on underserved communities and populations. The good news is that we do have lots of examples and research on investment strategies that do mitigate against or

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 14 of 32

prevent some of these negative outcomes that we are talking about. The problem from my perspective is that you have to be very intentional, you have to plan, you have to have kind of a coalition that organizes all the different players that are at fault, and you have to facilitate real community voice and real participation in the process. That's kind of a high standard that is often not met in practice when investment strategies are unfolding. We recommend that as all low-income neighborhoods are now experiencing investment locally as a result of ongoing like a plan with the transits, El Norte Sur, these are ongoing investments and on top of that we are going to have money coming in from the Inflation Reduction Act. We've got money coming from the bipartisan infrastructure bill, 40% of which the Biden Administration has mandated should be directed to historically marginalized communities. From my perspective, we are past the point of debating if we are going to invest in low-income neighborhoods, we are going to do it now and it's going to continue for the next ten years. So, as we do that, we recommend that we should set our community voice in the process, try very hard to create and retain community wealth, make sure the benefits of these investments flow to local residents, that we try very hard to prevent and mitigate displacement impacts, and that one of the ways we can do this is by integrating navigators and hubs into these low-income neighborhoods, so specific points of contact to get access to the benefits that people are eligible for but oftentimes are not actually receiving. So on mitigating displacement, I don't think I need to tell you, displacement can have a lot of negative effects, it can break up communities, it can break up local history and culture of areas in addition to the very severe negative effects that can have on households that are actually displaced, which include deterioration of health, mental and physical, increased hospitalizations, increased mortality especially for elders who are displaced, so these effects are very severe and negative and we should try hard to prevent them. So we argue that some of the protective policies that I just mentioned in the housing stability brief, if these are implemented prior to destabilizing investments, this can really push back preventively against some of these negative effects. You can do things like preserving existing affordable housing on a right to return for displaced residents like subsidized housing, provide financial support that allows people who have a small gap between their fixed income and their rent to stay in their home. And then again, I am a broken record on this, increasing the stock of affordable housing, and especially the stock of affordable housing in these low-income neighborhoods will go a long way to help mitigate against some of these negative outcomes. On the navigators and hubs, what we are imagining is that having locations where people can go to get connected to different benefit systems. Currently, benefits as we know are across a number of different programs, oftentimes people who participate in one benefit system are eligible for many others but they are not enrolled in those. The research is very clear that when people are enrolled in more than one benefit system, they are much more likely to not be experiencing housing insecurity, and much less likely to experience eviction or foreclosure. So basically we want to enhance the ease and hopefully break out some of the stigma that surrounds interacting with these benefit systems, so people could get more access to the benefits in many cases for which they are totally entitled and in my opinion should be receiving, but there are so many hurdles that it is very difficult sometimes for people to qualify or actually access the benefits. And the last, we argue that we should center community voice which means making a really substantive effort to provide multiple points at which community members can participate in the process, allow real decision making power in the process for those community members, kind of draw on existing trusted community organizations in that process, and in some cases maybe supporting participation by organizations or individuals, and then you have to go out of your way to kind of address some of the barriers that might prevent folks from certain backgrounds from participating in these community voice

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 15 of 32

opportunities. There's often a problem where certain set of who kind of always participate and you have to go out of your way to make sure you are breaking down those dynamics and reducing barriers for some folks who traditionally may not participate in these processes. Ok, so we are making the argument that on that piece that we should present a menu to community residents to say these are these different aspects, so on slide #34 is the Child Opportunity Index. These are all evidence-based characteristics of neighborhoods that have been found to have impact on children's long-term, employment, education, health outcomes. So they are going to hear evidence of improving all of these will positively impact children's outcomes. So these are things like early childhood education, public schools, access to resources, the health and safety of the environment, the pollutants and other types of toxins, access to health care, then access to jobs and things of that nature. So the idea is we present this and say, what feels most important to you to focus on and build the sort of investments around what community members want us to focus on. So that is the end of my section. I will turn it back over to Bonnie. I just want to say again, thank you so much, and I will tell my parents that my long hair is not a problem because three of the four men on this panel have long hair. (Laughter).

Ms. Bazata: I'm back and I want to talk to you about workforce. So, you know Betty mentioned, and as anybody who knows Art Eckstrom knows that that was his corner, workforce development, and that's the department I am a part of. So when we started this process I figured that's going to be the policy that's going to be first. I always say there's three ways to get out of poverty, you get a better job, you marry up, or you win the lottery. So most of us are stuck with the first choice. But it was interesting to find out that traditional workforce development didn't come in and for probably a couple of obvious reasons when we think about it, one is that half the jobs in Pima County are low-wage jobs. So we get you a job but it's not a job that's enough to get you out of poverty. Or, a lot of people who are starting in poverty aren't getting to those higher wage jobs because the system isn't working for them. So we dug up some more research and what we found is, and we say, think of all the barriers that low-income folks have to get those better paying jobs. It could be skill set, it could be kids in childcare, it could be transportation, it could be digital skills, that's coming to the fore more and more, and just the way emergencies get in the way. I always say it's easier to get a job than keep a job when you are in poverty because things just happen and they get in the way. So we looked at three programs and looked for randomized studies and one shows that it really works. Slide #37a, you will see the three programs, Project Quest, Verscala, and Year-Up, and they all, we are working with the populations we are interested in, opportunity youths, single moms, struggling families, but they all have additional supports. They had more case management, they had a longer timeframe with people, they had wrap-around support so they could help you with rent, or if your car breaks down, you know, solve some of those problems. It had more work experience that was work based experience so I could find if I really want this job and how it's going to work for me. And better relationships with employers, so that employees were invested in the person that was coming to them for the workforce training. I really love the Year-Up Program. I'd love to see it come to Tucson. It works with Opportunity Youth, it targets certain sectors. That is the other thing, these are sectorbased programs, so we know that this particular sector is going to get you to a better paying job. And they have what they call a high support, high expectations, high touch model, and those are the ones that seem to work the best. We are very fortunate in Pima County, Job (inaudible) which is actually modeled after Project Quest out of Texas and they have the numbers to show, 90% of their students complete their eligibility level as 80% of AMI, which is a little bit above poverty level but not too far above that. 85% get a job within six months Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 16 of 32

in their area and the starting salary is around close to \$50,000. So they show some real impact. They have a model that I think works, and also, we are very lucky. Pima Community College is considered one of the top Community Colleges in the Country. I'm reading a book out of Harvard right now, they were one of five community colleges selected to be profiled. They have done a lot of reinvention of themselves in the workforce development space and they offer a lot, and a lot of these jobs don't require degrees, but they do require credentials, some kind of training that is going to give them the slot that they need to get into that job. And Pima Community College does a great job of not only creating that, but also creating the wrap around supports. You can get a GED while getting your certificate. A lot of times, you don't have to have a GED or a high school diploma to get started. And also, they work on what I call stackable credentials, so you can start as a CNA, but we want you to keep moving up the healthcare path and they have also brought in navigation. I am a huge fan of navigators. Oftentimes you need that person to help you figure out how to make the system work, how do you enroll, or how do you work your way through the system. Pima Community College has put in two different kinds of navigators, both for academic coaching, but also then to sort of manage problems that come up. And so again, the research is clear that it needs collaboration across these different systems, more coaching and case management, it has to be sector based, it needs those work experiences and those wrap around supports. And we need this, too, because as Keith mentioned, there is going to be money coming into communities for green infrastructure jobs. These are jobs that are going to be one generation to help families get to those better paying opportunities. But the problem they are reporting across the country is that we don't have the workforce that is ready to take those jobs. So this is an opportunity for us to really expand our workforce options so we can help more low-income families stay the force, get the training and take advantage of those higher paying jobs. The Justice 40 Initiative which is a part of the Biden Administration says that 40% of these funds that are coming from the federal government must be spent for communities that are considered disadvantaged, so we need to be prepared for this. So our policy reads, prioritize workforce development for low-income job seekers with evidence-based case management practices that include apprenticeships, on the job training, and support services that prepares participants for jobs with self sufficient wages and benefits. We have another policy that looks at job quality issues, how do we push forward for more jobs that are going to have those kinds of wages and benefits to help families get out of poverty. It's more of an economic development frame, but this one is really in workforce. So those are three of our policies, three of our twelve, and I am so grateful to Allison Miller and Nicole Fife who have been working with us shoulderto-shoulder in this process. Allison is with the City of Tucson's Housing and Community Development, and we would love to answer any questions you may have.

Mayor Diaz: Are you ready for questions and answers?

Ms. Bazata: Yes.

Mayor Diaz: How about answers, ok. Brian.

Councilor Flagg: You were talking about the so-called green new deal, right? That didn't get passed, did it?

Ms. Bazata: There's three pretty big funding bills that got passed that will fund at least part of this.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 17 of 32

Mr. Bentley: Yes, bipartisan infrastructure bill and Inflation Reduction Act. So a bunch of the green new deal made it into the Inflation Reduction Act with that name change. Much of the Inflation Reduction Act is for greenbelts and has green infrastructure.

Councilor Flagg: So maybe it got half-way passed?

Mr. Bentley: It is the largest federal investment in climate ever, it is a significant investment.

Councilor Flagg: And I have other questions for Professor Bentley. Your presentation was really right on. I heard you talk and you really wrap it up and lay it out well, but you know, we could do that all day long and into the night, and to me, it comes down to money. So is there any money to make it happen? I know the County at least partly due to the community pushing them, like Supervisor Heinz and Supervisor Grijalva went to bat and got the eviction lawyers for people being evicted program going, so that's good but that's kind of a measly \$2 million a year, and in terms of building all this housing, like every developer I've heard says, I'd love to do affordable housing but you know, it just doesn't pencil out. So it doesn't get built. So what good are governments? Aren't we supposed to regulate to make things for the common good? It's all about funding, so I mean, what about the funding? There's no money to do all these programs. And I think on the workforce development, there's all these things you brought out, we have one stop and we have a workforce investment board, so on some level you can point to that and Pima County and say, well that's kind of funded and up and going and doing it, but housing, it ain't funded, is it?

Ms. Bazata: (Inaudible) allocating \$5 million a year for the last three years. We're not just using it for, like you said, housing developers say they don't have enough with the gap in funding, so we have an Affordable Housing Commission that Betty was serving on, and I believe we are looking for a new representative from South Tucson on that from the Housing Commission. But our first step with these policies is to get the Board of Supervisors and other City Councils to adopt them so we can then go through our budgets and really realign our budgets so that we are targeting our spending in these particular areas, but we know some of these areas are going to need more funding. But yes, we are starting to do that, but if we don't have the policies in place then we can't realign our budgets with those policies.

Councilor Flagg: Do you think \$5 million is like paltry or do you look at it as an improvement over nothing?

Ms. Bazata: It's an improvement. Right now, we put out the last request for proposals. We had \$10 million in requests, some of which came in the South Tucson area, and we had about \$5 million available. We just put out today another request for proposal, I think we had about \$8 million remaining, so it will be open for another week in order to solicit housing development proposals.

Mr. Bentley: There's another \$150 million in the State Housing Trust Fund. That's up from I think nothing a few years ago.

Councilor Flagg: Yeah.

Mr. Bentley: We also have conversations about a bond, I don't know if that will happen but that's another mechanism that people are pointing to, to fund this.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 18 of 32

Councilor Flagg: Do you think even you should, like your prosperity project, could involve advocating with the Supervisors to put a whole boatload more money into housing, because it cost a lot of money to do housing, and you know, so you're doing \$8 million more this year. Is that really very much considering the problem, considering the budget of Pima County? I don't know, what's your take?

Mr. Bentley: I am advocating for that, not through the prosperity initiative, but I do think we need to pressure. I think that our logic is that if we outline these policies and we highlight the benefits, then you have an analysis of how much it would actually cost and then you have to find a funding mechanism. So, we are hoping that once these are passed that builds the momentum, it allows the agencies to I would say redirect a significant amount of existing funding to serving priorities, which most of it in my opinion are quite different as to how we practice now, so that's the first part. In addition, in both cases, investing in more resources. I don't disagree with you. What we are outlining here would be a large increase in expenditures on housing and these other protective services relative to what we have now. I think we are trying to make the case of long-term cost savings of investing and preventing a lot of these harms, is actually a net cost benefit in the long term and obviously involves a huge investment and that's not a bad thing.

Ms. Bazata: I was going to add, if I may, it takes a lot of layers of funding to get projects done, so this is one layer, and then the feds have another layer, the City has another layer, and then the developer has another layer. So it does take a lot of layers of funding to get these projects done and yeah, while \$8 million is nothing, if you did one project, maybe you could do one project with that, but even a small project, but something, it's showing the political will and more than anything, if you have a political will to do affordable housing then staff and stakeholders can do their part as well. But it takes everybody, and we have good evidence to believe these policies will help us be more competitive for grants that are going to be coming, so this positions us better for some, to your point, where's the money going to come from. This should help us to be able to bring more money in.

Councilor Flagg: Ok.

Mayor Diaz: Ok, Acting Mayor Rita, do you have any questions?

Acting Mayor Rogers: Yes, I guess I would just comment on it. I went through every single page for a week on the whatever, but some, my biggest issue sometimes when I read it off is I consider does Pima County, just the City of Tucson, not Pima County, Tucson versus South Tucson ones, I think a million, ten thousand folks, of which these, the stuff I got about it was from Tucson versus 5,000 or so in South Tucson. So, I have a lot of different issues, but I don't care to talk about the difference between that population with all of the stuff that is here. I'm not saying it's bad or anything. I'm saying I do differently like say, Vail, Arizona, versus all of Pima County, all of Tucson, over a million, five thousand more, it's a different way. Of course, my background is sociology.

Ms. Bazata: Please know that I am available to talk in more detail and I would look forward to that opportunity.

Acting Mayor Rogers: I'm very happy about getting your stuff and this is my thought.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 19 of 32

Ms. Bazata: And I appreciate that. It is important to air our differences, right. There's not one representation there, there's many different communities.

Mayor Diaz: Anybody else have questions? No?

Councilor Valenzuela: When are the meetings? I would like to attend, I would like to participate, and also have a connection with Betty, who was the housing representative, correct?

Ms. Villegas: I'm not on the Housing Commission anymore, I had to step down.

Councilor Valenzuela: For this task force?

Ms. Villegas: For this group, I'm still on there and they are open to the public, anybody can go.

Ms. Bazata: You certainly can go. I'll send the information along.

Councilor Flagg: When's the next meeting?

Ms. Bazata: It's the third Thursday of the month at 1:00. Do you want to attend virtually, or we meet on the 4<sup>th</sup> floor of the downtown library and if you want to come in person, that's also an opportunity.

Councilor Valenzuela: And Betty, you would stay on it as the representative for South Tucson?

Ms. Villegas: Not really. I don't know, as a rep that represents South Tucson, I will continue to represent South Tucson in everything I do, but on this one, it will be South Tucson and the rest of my region.

Councilor Valenzuela: Ok.

Mayor Diaz: Vice Mayor, do you have any questions?

Vice Mayor Lopez: No, Sir.

Mayor Diaz: Ok. Brian.

Councilor Flagg: I have a question for Professor Bentley. I really like how you talked about the investments, being keen about the investments that are coming into neighborhoods, barrios like ours, so you really need to check it out so it doesn't displace people. Along those lines, do you think that the streetcar was an investment that displaced or not displaced, and an extension of that is this Norte Sur that's going to happen, maybe, because the money is there for that, huh? Like, what is your opinion on that? Is it something that people should check out? I mean, you're a sociologist, you should know the studies and stuff, right?

Mr. Bentley: Sure. I think there is evidence that the streetcar did displace vulnerable residents, evidence to that effect. There are a number of studies of transportation lines that do show an absence of displacement effects so it really depends on what housing exists in the neighborhood to begin with, how much and what kind of activity that they brought to the different areas by that transportation, so I would say the literature is extremely mixed in terms of what actually happens about this practice. And I will just add to your prior question about funding. I think it is also really important to emphasize that it is very expensive to build affordable housing in our current system of laws and zoning regulations, and in a situation where we have

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 20 of 32

different zoning laws that allow the development of much denser units with many more affordable units currently which is very hard to build under our current zoning laws. I think you can get a much more impact for those investments at not the kind of astronomical cost that you would incur based at our current zoning laws. So I just wanted to add that there are a lot of organizations and individuals who would be very excited to build real genuine accessible affordable housing, but they do need a little support and I think they might need some changes to existing zoning laws to kind of implement those kinds of projects.

Councilor Flagg: Are you talking City of Tucson, South Tucson, or everywhere?

Ms. Bazata: Here in Pima County.

Councilor Flagg: Pima County.

Mayor Diaz: I have a couple comments. First is that I guess the things that separate us, really, there's a couple of things, and that's similar to political pressure, the particular groups wanting their agendas first. And the other thing is most of the, everybody looks at the money problem as far as the overall picture it will not solve it because of the fact that it is a lot of greed, a lot of things to do for a particular person and/or a particular group where the money is there. I mean, if it was distributed correctly but a particular person or whatever opinion they are, they have a tendency to more favor this side or that side or whatever side they are on. So, for example, education. It's controlled by the State. Teachers aren't getting paid enough money.

### Councilor Flagg: Amen.

Mayor Diaz: They can't get affordable housing or they are struggling, the working poor, so on and on it's, we, especially at our level at City of South Tucson, we have a tendency to say yes, we are poor, we are low-income, we are this or that, but the real problem is that somebody in the State is saying no, we're not going to give money to teachers, and in fact there's a bond right now for buildings, you know, for Tucson Unified School District. So again, we get separated, we're going to say yes to the bonds and no to the teachers because at the State level, at this level, so we are separated. So now we have the employers. The employers can discriminate any way they want to and I'm talking about second chance. The population in South Tucson is the fact that we need second chances. There's a lot of people that got released from prison for low crimes and all this other kind of stuff. Where do they end up? Low rents, low this and that or making it out or become homeless or become all over the place. There again, the employers can discriminate, or the employers can actually participate in these studies, but they won't because they want the profits. They talk about it's pencil-wise, they don't equate to low income. Well, the financial institutions are also in this, they're not looking at this person being homeless, they are looking at their bottom line. So, if you are going to qualify, how in the heck can you qualify with \$36,000 a year?

## Councilor Flagg: Yep.

Mayor Diaz: No way. You're going to subsidize it, yeah, maybe, Section 8 or whatever, or rent control or whatever, but now, there's how many tax categories are on your property list? I count seven. Now they are different. Now they are going up every year. So again, it's not the fact that we're not attempting to go up higher. We're low income, yes, but we need to be able to go up higher than the low income. I really disagree with the reports and stuff because it's the whole system. We make laws. You can't drive a car without

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 21 of 32

insurance, you know, and again, public transportation is falling down because of the fact that, hey, the jobs aren't over here, the jobs are way over there, so I need a car, I need to get over there. And the busses don't travel there or the schedules or whatever, we need both. We need to be able to access our jobs, the infrastructure. Again, the companies come in with their own people. What good is that for Tucson or Pima County for that matter. So on and on, everything is against, and if we accept these policies, I'd like to really see, you know, something concrete that's going to really put us up to the next level from poverty.

Councilor Flagg: Right on.

Mayor Diaz: It's education and employment, the two top priorities in my book. I'm sorry.

Mr. Bentley: No, no, you're fine.

Councilor Aguirre: That was good, Mayor, thank you. I think you made a lot of really, really good points, Mayor. I think one of the things that was not in this discussion, and I think would also be very helpful, would be rent control, which is another issue that on the state level we have no control over, right. And so we know we have these issues, the separation of our local government versus the state, which I'm hoping might start changing a little bit in the future, but I'm about solutions, trying to figure out what we can do as a City and what we can do as Council members here and so I think it is our job to try to figure out, and of course, with the help of our Staff, our City Manager and our Attorney, to try to figure out what policies, laws, that we can pass here in our City on what changes we can do to our zoning to really get some of this stuff going. Try to find some loopholes for rent control things that we can be smart about within our City and work toward these goals because I'm with you. I agree with everything you said, Mayor, there's a lot of obstacles and a lot of roadblocks in the way to make this kind of plan actually happen. And so, I think our focus needs to be on what we can do as the City of South Tucson, just like how Pima County is doing, and the Tribe is doing and all the other municipalities that are working on this program. What laws can we pass, what loopholes can we find, what zoning can we change and create in our City to make this actually happen.

Councilor Flagg: Yeah, and the thing about rent control is it is illegal in the State of Arizona. That's just not by magic or Betty's compadres in Phoenix are awful people. It's about money and it's about the lobby of the realtors, the Tucson Association of Realtors, the Southern Arizona Homebuilders, the Chamber of Commerce, Multi-housing Association, that's your lobby, so you need to have three votes to go jam those guys, make them do the right thing, the kind of thing that would make my Mayor happy, like where we have something like rent control happen. What has happened in real life in the last year or so, the City of Tucson stepped up and said that we should have differential water rates and that the people in the Foothills, basically, people in the County should pay higher water bills, and not only did it not go over well with them, I think it passed in the City, but the County came and said, we're going to sue you, how dare you mess with the rich people. So, I mean, those are some of the things I think the County needs to deal with, is to find three votes to pay a differential water rate. And that money was going to be used in part for programs for low-income people and stuff like that. I don't know, there needs to be a deeper analysis and some advocacy on the part of I think three votes on the Supervisors, since you guys are here. Thanks to the City for doing that water differential. They don't take on the developers either, ADU's, 36<sup>th</sup> and La Cholla, I could go on and on. Thanks.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 22 of 32

Ms. Bazata: I just want to thank you for your comments and it's a complex issue and one of the things I say is poverty is really expensive, right. Actually the status quo is very ineffective and it's expensive and we need to make some changes, and this is the idea is that we need prosperity from the bottom up, right. We can build a stronger economy and a stronger community when we are putting our focus on how we help low-income families build stability.

Councilor Flagg: Tell that to three votes on the Supervisors. I'm not trying to be a wise guy, really. They need to embrace that and vote the right way or it kind of negates any kind of like wonderful thing that you pass, you know.

Ms. Bazata: And Councilor Flagg, I just want to say December 5<sup>th</sup> is when we are taking this to the Board of Supervisors, so about three weeks before that you will get a final report, and we will also be asking you to look at those policies and consider adopting some of them, too, or adopting a version that fits best for South Tucson. So, we are asking the same of Oro Valley, we talked to their Council, we talked to Marana Town Council, Sahuarita Council, saying, which of these policies best fits you so that we can all kind of move forward. So, December 5<sup>th</sup>, feel free to come to the Board of Supervisors meeting and talk about these issues.

Councilor Flagg: Ok, great.

Ms. Bazata: Or at least send an email in support or something to show your support. Thank you, and it's going to take a lot of effort from all of us over a long period of time, but let's get started, right. Thank you so much, appreciate your time.

Councilors: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: Thank you for the presentation. The next item is Item #10.

# ITEM #10 - FINANCE DIRECTOR'S REPORT & UPDATE: GENERAL FUND OVERVIEW

Ms. Aguirre: Thank you, Mr. Mayor, Members of the Council. I'm going to go ahead and hand out some reports, I'll be brief. So what I am handing out to you all is basically just a summary report. I'll be giving you detailed reports hopefully at the next meeting. These that you are getting are preliminary, very preliminary. September just ended on Saturday, but I want to give you guys an update. So, the report that you have on top goes over last year. Again, this is a preliminary unaudited report. The bottom line as we are looking at the numbers now is an operating gain of about \$1 million. When we were going through the budget process, we estimated that we were going to have an operating gain or surplus of about \$740,000, \$744,000. The majority of that operating surplus comes from savings in Departments, from some vacant positions that lasted throughout the year, but some of the excess surplus, we knew about \$744,000, but the additional \$280,000 is pretty much from revenues. So, our City sales tax came through with just shy of \$300,000, and those figures we found out about by the end of August, because we're still collecting on prior year's sales tax. And also, licenses and permits. Take a look at licenses and permits, it surpassed the budget by about 125%, almost \$80,000 above the estimated budget, so that was wonderful. You will have these reports to refer to. Hopefully for the next meeting I will have detailed reports to go along with them. At that point, if there's any adjustments, I will let you know about them. So that's it for fiscal year end June 30, 2023. The next page that you have there is for our current fiscal year budget. As of September 30<sup>th</sup>, 25% of our fiscal year had lapsed, and we are running on our expenditure side, about 60%. Our revenues are at about 15%, but the net

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 23 of 32

operating loss is \$164,000. So, what that means is that expenditures surpassed revenues for the first few months but that is not unusual. It takes a little while for revenues to catch up and that starts to happen around December. I don't know if any of you have any questions but if you come up with questions from now until the next meeting, we can certainly address them.

Acting Mayor Rogers: It's just preliminary, isn't it?

Ms. Aguirre: This is just preliminary, yeah. At the next meeting I will have a little bit more details on highlights, I'll have those detailed reports and we will be able to identify any challenges or concerns we're looking at.

Councilor Flagg: Hey, Chief, you don't think there's no way around, you really do feel the need to have that DEA agent line in there? In your mind is that pretty important to us?

Chief Denogean: It's important. I'm thinking about it all the time, I mean, it's important that we contribute, but there are times I give a lot of contemplation if we are not better off without it, but I still feel it is good that we keep someone there at this point.

Councilor Flagg: \$52,000 bucks, \$53, that's a lot here.

Mayor Diaz: If I may, Chief, and correct me if I am wrong. Every time there is a bust, even if it is not in South Tucson, if it's in the County or some place, all the agencies are going to show up for their share of possible, whatever they get.

Councilor Flagg: Is that RICO?

Chief Denogean: That's RICO.

Mayor Diaz: Yeah, so theoretically, if we show up with our agents and stuff like this, we can participate in the distribution.

Councilor Flagg: We should get it anyway.

Chief Denogean: No, it's always shared because you have multiple officers from different agencies, so it's always shared among the agencies. It cuts it down a little. About two years ago, the laws changed and made it much more difficult to seize property and so it used to be without a conviction you could take the money and the property. Now you need a conviction and I believe also until that conviction happens, the money they have that is coming from their profits of drug making can be used as a defense, so it's been a lot more difficult in the last couple of years. We still have received some money. I will not, I'll admit that I am disappointed in the amount we have gotten in the two years I've been here, but there's still money that is in the pipeline that we are supposed to get and I'm hoping, so we'll see, it takes a lot longer to get seizures now than it used to also.

Councilor Aguirre: You've got to wait until the court proceedings, and everything is all over.

Chief Denogean: Yes.

Councilor Flagg: Do you have a rough estimate of what that dollar sum might be?

Chief Denogean: It's very difficult and complicated to say. I know that they have like a few hundred thousand dollar thing that they just worked, but it determines on how much is divided upon how many different people,

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 24 of 32

and if they are able to (inaudible). The other thing to take into consideration that the City of South Tucson, we get contributions from many other agencies to help us, so it is important that we are part of the team and that we show contributions to other places, and that we are part of the team and we are contributing.

Councilor Flagg: Is there any other way to do that, to contribute, I don't know.

Chief Denogean: That's the only way we're kind of doing it right now. We work well with our partners, with the City of Tucson and with the County, but we take a lot from them, and we don't give as much as we take.

Councilor Flagg: Right.

Chief Denogean: And that is something we consider. We are always looking for ways to contribute and be part of the team.

Councilor Valenzuela: I have a question on the sales tax. Has South Tucson ever done a sales tax audit, do we practice that normally?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, Mr. Mayor and Councilor Valenzuela, we actually perform per se, audits on the tax bills that we receive, but we do rely on the Department of Revenue. Their regulations, their practices have become more stringent as to where all cities and towns have to refer cases for audit through them.

Councilor Valenzuela: Have we ever done one?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, there have been cases that have been referred to them and some of them have been successful.

Councilor Valenzuela: Ok, should we consider doing something like that? It seems like the sales taxes are pretty low.

Ms. Aguirre: We have had, before those regulations were implemented by State statute then by Department of Revenue, we had a consultant come down and basically take a look at the taxable in relation to the earnings from businesses and they didn't notice any irregularities where it would raise a flag.

Councilor Flagg: Was that Chapman Fenster who did that?

Ms. Aguirre: No, no it was not.

Councilor Flagg: We just did it aside from that?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes.

Councilor Valenzuela: And then, can you explain to me what developmental services are?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, Mr. Mayor, Councilor Valenzuela, developmental services is the department that houses the Planning and Zoning Director, Code Enforcement, Building Inspector, those positions.

Councilor Valenzuela: So this money goes to their salaries?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, that is correct, as do all the other line items in there. It includes salaries, benefits, operating costs for each department.

Councilor Valenzuela: Ok, thank you.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 25 of 32

Mayor Diaz: Are there any more questions? That concludes Item #10.

Councilor Flagg: Can I ask one more? You know, bond payment, what's P&I mean, on the bottom?

Ms. Aguirre: Principal and Interest.

Councilor Flagg: Ok, yeah. Is there like any way, how do I put it, not tricks, but ways we can go, have you thought about ways to lower that?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes, as a matter of fact, Mr. Mayor and Councilor Flagg, in 2019 we were able to reduce the interest rate nearly in half on the existing bond that we had. We refinanced about \$6.7 million on that bond and we cut the interest rate I believe from six to three percent.

Councilor Flagg: How do you do that? Can you briefly say something about how you do that?

Ms. Aguirre: Well, the bond money we've always financed, it's like a loan, so this process would kind of be like refinancing your mortgage.

Councilor Flagg: Ok. Can you keep doing that?

Ms. Aguirre: You can, however, there's costs involved with the issuance of bonds every time you do it. It extends the life of it, you know, but it gets expensive.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Does the compound double up as you're renewing your loan, or are you willing to take on another loan.

Ms. Aguirre: I don't believe so, Vice Mayor.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Ok.

Mayor Diaz: Are there any more questions? Ok, that concludes that Item. The next item is Item #11.

# ITEM #11 - RESOLUTION NO. 23-30 OF THE MAYOR AND COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF SOUTH TUCSON, ARIZONA, RATIFYING, APPROVING AND ADOPTING A FISCAL YEAR 2023-2024 BUDGET MODIFICATION WITHIN ESTIMATED REVENUE AND APPROPRIATIONS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2023-2024

Mayor Diaz: Ms. Aguirre.

Ms. Aguirre: Sorry, Mr. Mayor, I was a little distracted. What I am going to hand out to you all is a little Table, and I apologize, when I put together the budget modification chart that lists all the GL accounts numbers, there's going to be about 30, but I ran out of time, but all the information is here on this Table. So what we are bringing to you all for review, discussion and possible approval is, I deleted two adjustments, an adjustment for Department Head compensation. Essentially what we want to do is realign the compensation to the existing pay structure. It was off just a bit when we filled the vacancy in the Housing Department, but that was just something that had to be done to fill the position and retain staff. And again, we do have other Department Heads here who are tenure, and this is just to realign the existing pay structure with that recent change that occurred in Housing. City Manager, I don't know if you want to –

Ms. Moreno: Absolutely, thank you, Lourdes. Mayor and Council, just to reiterate what Lourdes said, to continue with the alignment of our salary structure, and with the resignation of Betty Villegas, at the time I brought her in at a higher rate than her predecessor because at that time, the City needed to fill that position

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 26 of 32

right at that moment, so the position was increased in an effort to make sure the Housing operation continued without interruption. So that means the plan was for her to stay for up to two years. She brought on the current Director that we have now which is Imelda, and the plan was again, to go out and recruit. But in an effort to make sure we continued the operation without interruption and to negotiate a rate with Imelda, I wanted to make sure there was no other option and that she was paid according with working with what the responsibilities to the level of the Housing Director is going to work toward. Especially with all the challenges the Housing Authority is facing, they are still considered a troubled state. There's reorganization that needs to still be done which we are working on. It's a matter of two vacancies right now in the Housing Authority. One would be Maintenance Technician and also the Housing Specialist, two positions. So there was a reorganization, we have to create new job descriptions and really work toward making sure that the Department is funded and have the exact amount of positions that they need to operate accordingly. So far I have heard a lot of positive feedback from constituents, from the Housing Authority, from you all, and I think the money was worthy of who we have now. Imelda is doing a great job, she communicates, and not many people without interruption again in the Housing Authority. I don't even have even the same amount I paid her predecessor, but pay structure for the rest of the Department, so this is brought to Mayor and Council requesting you approve that so we can stay with the structure and make sure that the Department Heads that has been with us for the tenure they have, you know, a term equitable within that structure.

## Mayor Diaz: Any questions?

Ms. Moreno: And if I may add, and I may sound selfish, but I never actually done this since I have been in this role, and this is my third time in this role, but the position of Human Resources Director and City Clerk has actually helped towards giving the City a surplus, but in the last, say maybe off and on maybe a total of seven years, so that position I still continue to be responsible to for H.R. and City Clerk. It has helped the City in other ways in paying toward Public Safety or helping in different ways. But I still continue to serve the Mayor and Council as your City Manager, and I am also your City Clerk and H.R. Director. I just want to make sure I point that out, whether the Council wishes to move forward with election of that position, I would assume, of course, that role, but at the same token, that position has actually created savings for the City, because City Manager position is not getting paid any more with me being responsible for those other divisions.

Councilor Valenzuela: So I just had a question. Who is the Planning and Zoning Director?

Ms. Moreno: Josue.

Councilor Valenzuela: It is Jose, ok. I thought it was Greg Hitt that was the Director.

Ms. Moreno: Greg is a consultant.

Councilor Valenzuela: Ok, thank you. So this is a 10% increase across the board?

Ms. Aguirre: So essentially, what we did was we evaluated increase that occurred in the Housing Authority, it was an increase of about 6.6%, so that's what we took and applied it to the salary structure for Department Heads.

Councilor Valenzuela: 6.6% across the board?

Ms. Aguirre: Yes.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 27 of 32

Acting Mayor Rogers: Mr. Mayor, I just want to give Lourdes my opinion. I would prefer a fourth firefighter for the people.

Councilor Aguirre: What did you mean, Rita?

Acting Mayor Rogers: To have some money for a fourth firefighter.

Councilor Flagg: Oh, ok.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Very much care about it.

Mayor Diaz: Ok, so this money, does that reduce the surplus that we had before?

Ms. Aguirre: No, essentially Mr. Mayor, one of the things you could do is you could reallocate money from contingency to the Departments if you all wanted to move forward with this Item. You do have additional funding that was made available at the last fiscal year, so I think it would be covered. One of the things I do want to mention is that when I provided you all with the estimate on the agenda summary, I indicated it would be approximately \$35,000, but running the numbers it's \$40,000. However, the Police Department, if you were to refer back to their personnel roster, they do have a line item in there that indicates, it's like a cumulative savings from reorganizations that they performed, so you could utilize \$5,000 from there, from that Department, to fund the Public Safety Director and then the \$35,000 from contingency.

Councilor Flagg: Contingency is like \$80 or \$90,000, right?

Ms. Aguirre: Unused, that is correct, Mr. Mayor, Councilor Flagg.

Mayor Diaz: Any other questions?

Councilor Valenzuela: I just think that we work it out with the little resources we have, so I'm for it.

Ms. Aguirre: Thank you.

Mayor Diaz: Questions? No? Do I have a motion?

Acting Mayor Rogers: What's the motion?

Vice Mayor Lopez: Mr. Mayor, I make a motion that we approve Resolution No. 23-30 of the Mayor and Council of the City of South Tucson, ratifying, approving and adopting a fiscal year 2023-2024 budget modification within estimated revenue and appropriations for fiscal year 2023-2024.

Councilor Valenzuela: Second.

Mayor Diaz: It's been Moved and Seconded. Roll Call (by Ms. Moreno).

Vice Mayor Lopez. Yes. Acting Mayor Rogers. No. Mayor Diaz. Yes. Councilor Flagg. Yes. Councilor Aguirre. Yes. Councilor Valenzuela. Yes.

Ms. Moreno: Motion passes.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 28 of 32

Mayor Diaz: The next item is Item #12.

#### ITEM #12 - DISCUSSION, DIRECTION REGARDING COUNCIL RETREAT

Mayor Diaz: I guess it was kind of a request that we have a retreat, so does anybody have, I guess we are looking for dates and times, possible discussion regarding the retreat itself. I guess we are kind of saying we do need a retreat, so it's also recommended that we do it with a facilitator. Discussion?

Councilor Valenzuela: Does a facilitator cost the City money or is that something we can arrange for a volunteer?

Councilor Flagg: No, they need, the City Manager could be the facilitator for a retreat.

Councilor Valenzuela: Yeah.

Ms. Moreno: I would recommend that the Council find a neutral person or a proctor to be able to conduct the retreat. We can reach out to the League of Cities and Towns, they have professionals up there that could come down and give a retreat, and possibly talk to the University of Arizona and get a professor that would cost us money where the League would not. A proctor can conduct the retreat for so it is neutral, and can kind of help you discuss your roles, make sure that you all work together, so with direction given to me, we can reach out to whomever you wish and it can be scheduled for a day during the week on an off meeting, or it could be on a weekend, it could be like three or four hours.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Mr. Mayor, this retreat, this conversation started when we were at the League of Cities conference, and I have two individuals who volunteered to do the retreat on our behalf so hopefully we can get better at what we are supposed to be doing. It's a group of individuals from Sahuarita, the Mayor and the City Manager. They came to us asking that they are willing to assist us in presenting atthe retreat and just wanting to see how the City Council felt about that and to see whether they would be allowed to come and give this retreat for us.

Councilor Aguirre: Mayor, if I could.

Mayor Diaz: Go ahead.

Councilor Aguirre: I don't know how I would feel about anyone from another municipality coming in and trying to work with us to do a retreat. I think if somebody neutral like the City Manager said would be a better idea. I kind of like the idea of Arizona League of Cities and Towns to do that only because we never really know what the interest of another municipality might be with our municipality, you know, I don't know what their municipality's interest or intent would be with behind helping us with something like that for us, so staying neutral and keeping it neutral would be best.

Councilor Valenzuela: But I think it would be good to just talk to them, too, as co-Council with Mayor and not as a retreat but as a discussion. We should definitely set that up.

Mayor Diaz: That could be in a different setting, though, as far as it would be a peer to peer meeting, or something like that.

City Attorney Paladini: Mayor, I would recommend it not be at City Hall, that it be a more informal setting, around a table, and if you wanted to do a breakfast through lunch, a four-five hour retreat, it would be better to do it away from City Hall.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 29 of 32

Councilor Valenzuela: And I was going to say I'd prefer to do it in the daytime because it is easier for me to get babysitting, so that would be ideal for me.

Mayor Diaz: So daytime, 8-12:00?

Councilor Flagg: I'm screwed.

Councilor Valenzuela: 9-ish.

Mayor Diaz: 9-1:00?

Councilor Valenzuela: Actually, it would have to be a little later.

Councilor Aguirre: Like noon to 3 or noon to 4, something like that?

Councilor Valenzuela: It would be hard for all of us to come together. I guess 9 to whatever.

Councilor Flagg: Afternoons always work better for me. Maybe I could wheel and deal, work it out.

Mayor Diaz: And a weekend, Saturday or Sunday? Weekday?

Councilor Flagg: Saturdays is when people do retreats.

Mayor Diaz: Rita? Saturday?

Acting Mayor Rogers: I don't care.

Councilor Valenzuela: Saturday, is a facilitator available on a weekend?

City Attorney Paladini: It's probably easier to get somebody on a Saturday.

Councilor Valenzuela: Saturday would be easier for me, actually.

Councilor Flagg: Yeah, I think so. That's the normal thing.

City Attorney Paladini: Yeah, it is. Most of the time it is done on a Saturday, or I've been to retreats that are two days long, like Friday/Saturday. Easiest is Saturday, so if you start at 9 with a target to kind of end at 1.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Yeah.

City Attorney Paladini: You may get out of there a little early, or you may get out of there a little later.

Councilor Valenzuela: The holidays are coming so we have to schedule this pretty soon or after the holidays.

Mayor Diaz: So possibly next Saturday?

Councilor Valenzuela: Well, I think we have to give direction for them to reach out and find us a good proctor.

Ms. Moreno: Mr. Mayor, I will reach out to the League with your consensus and see when they are available and then I will get back to you.

City Attorney Paladini: I wouldn't recommend doing it this quickly on the 7<sup>th</sup>, but the three Saturdays in October, the 14<sup>th</sup>, 21<sup>st</sup> and 28<sup>th</sup>, and I think I can't stress enough it is really important that every member of the Council show up for the retreat, that's really important.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 30 of 32

Mayor Diaz: Right.

City Attorney Paladini: So Councilor Romero, you see what her schedule allows for Saturday, but for one of those three we can probably find somebody to help moderate the retreat if that works. And the only reason I recommend against doing it this Saturday is you want to find a place off City Hall, it may take a little bit to find something that works.

Mayor Diaz: Does anybody have any preference for location? I would suggest the Kettle. They have a separate room away from the restaurant next door. They can accommodate quite a few people.

Councilor Flagg: Anywhere in South Tucson?

Councilor Valenzuela: Café Santa Rosa has a really cool backroom.

Mayor Diaz: Well, what happened last time at Santa Rosa is that they had fans.

Councilor Valenzuela: Like sports stuff?

Mayor Diaz: No, no, ceiling fans and we couldn't hear one another, and they had all kinds of problems with -

Acting Mayor Rogers: And no air conditioning.

Councilor Valenzuela: We can reach out and see if that can be fixed, and it's getting cooler, too. I'd like to support a local business.

Mayor Diaz: Where?

Councilor Valenzuela: Café Santa Rosa or local.

Mayor Diaz: Somewhere local.

Councilor Valenzuela: Yeah.

Councilor Flagg: Like South Tucson.

Mayor Diaz: Micha's also has a room there in the back.

Councilor Valenzuela: Ok.

Mayor Diaz: Ok, so we got location. Saturday. What was the time?

Councilor Valenzuela: I don't know, I think they need to reach out first.

Ms. Moreno: I'll reach out and get dates and make sure the League is available and make sure they are open at the restaurant.

Mayor Diaz: Ok.

Acting Mayor Rogers: Did you give a date yet?

Vice Mayor Lopez: There is not date.

City Attorney Paladini: One of the Saturdays in October, either the 14<sup>th</sup>, 21<sup>st</sup> or 28<sup>th</sup>. Those are the three dates they will look at to see if the room is available and when a moderator is available.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 31 of 32

Councilor Flagg: Can I just kind of, when you are wheeling and dealing it, like if you wanted to do an afternoon or starting at 11, that would kind of work for me. I don't know what everybody thinks, because we have to work it out.

Ms. Moreno: I'll ask them for a whole day and you guys can come up with a time. I'll just say like 8-5, and then we can pick a time anywhere in between that.

Councilor Flagg: That's a long time.

Ms. Moreno: I mean, I will ask for the whole day and then you guys can figure out a time.

Mayor Diaz: Ok, that's the consensus. We will go on to Item #13.

ITEM #13 - REPORT AND UPDATE REGARDING COUNCIL DIRECTION REGARDING REDEVELOPMENT

Ms. Moreno: Mayor, I would like to continue this conversation in Executive Session with the Attorney's approval. We need to make a motion.

Councilor Aguirre: We need to make a motion.

City Attorney Paladini: You will need to make a motion.

Mayor Diaz: Wait, this was just a report, though.

Councilor Valenzuela: She wants to report in Executive Session.

City Attorney Paladini: I think the reason is that what we want to report needs to be reported in Executive Session.

Mayor Diaz: Oh, ok.

Councilor Flagg: I move that we move out of Regular Session and go into Executive Session.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Second.

Mayor Diaz: It's been Moved and Seconded. Those in favor, signify by saying Aye.

Council Members: Unanimous Ayes.

Mayor Diaz: We are now into Executive Session.

City Council Adjourns Regular Session and Moves into Executive Session.

Mayor Diaz: I guess we need a motion to adjourn the Executive Session and reconvene into Regular Session.

Acting Mayor Rogers: So moved.

Councilor Flagg: Second.

Mayor Diaz: Moved and Seconded. Signify by saying Aye.

Council Members: Unanimous Ayes.

Mayor Diaz: Pass, ok.

Minutes of Regular Agenda Meeting October 3, 2023 Page 32 of 32

City Council exits Executive Session and reconvenes into Regular Session.

ITEM #14 - ADJOURNMENT

Mayor Diaz: I need a motion to adjorn.

Councilor Flagg: So moved.

Vice Mayor Lopez: Second.

Mayor Diaz: Signify.

Council Members: Unanimous Ayes.

The meeting adjourned at 9:14 p.m.

Mayor

ATTEST:

Veronica Moreno, City Clerk

#### **CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the Regular Agenda Meeting of the City Council of South Tucson, Arizona, held on the 3rd day of October, 2023. I further certify the meeting was duly called and a quorum was present.

Dated this \_\_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_\_, 2023.

Veronica Moreno, City Clerk